

Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of Reform Leadership Academy in the Transportation Office South Sulawesi Provincial Government

Wisber Wiryanto

Center of Public Administration Innovation, National Institute of Public Administration, Jakarta 10110, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: wisberwiryanto@yahoo.com

Bureaucratic reform in Indonesia through the development of competencies for state civil apparatus is carried out with education and training for governance purposes. One type of training is the Reform Leadership Academy (RLA). This training has been organized by the National Institute of Public Administration for five years. The formulation of problem is how to ability the alumni of RLA to carry out leadership reform in their organizational units? The purpose of this study is to improve RLA training in the future. Descriptive research methods are used in this research. Through a purposive sampling technique, a sample was chosen an alumni of RLA in the transportation office, South Sulawesi Provincial Government. Data collected was used questionnaire and interview about the implementation of reform initiatives by RLA alumni, in November 2018. Furthermore, qualitative analysis technique was used for analysis data collected. The results indicated in general as follows, the ability alumni of RLA in carrying out innovation and problem-solving in their duties and responsibilities was very increase. Relationship between RLA training materials and competencies was very significant. There was organizational support for alumni in carried out innovative solutions initiated, in the form of policies, infrastructure, budgets, and human resources.

Keywords: Post-training evaluation, Reform leadership academy, State civil apparatus.

ARTICLE INFORMATION

Received: 12 February 2020
Revised: 22 April 2020

Accepted: 01 May 2020

DOI: 10.31580/jpvai.v3i1.1311

© Readers Insight Publication

INTRODUCTION

Developing competency for state civil apparatus through education and training was importance (Law of Republic Indonesia No. 5/2015). One type of training is the Reform Leadership Academy (RLA). It has been organized by the National Institute of Public Administration (LAN) for five year. The aim of the RLA is to form an apparatus who has basic leadership knowledge and competencies in order to support the acceleration of the implementation of bureaucratic reform and governance (Regulate the Head of LAN).

The implementation of RLA was held every year since 2013, and has been running for 5 (five) years. Therefore, it is time to do for post-training evaluation of the alumni of RLA. The post training evaluation of alumni RLA was done by superior, subordinate, colleague and customer. They are to assess the alumni capabilities in terms the ability to plan new changes, change leadership and change development (Regulation the Head of LAN No. 37/2015).

This evaluation was conducted to know the success and failure of the implementation of the RLA. Furthermore, to provide RLA recommendations for implementation in the future. In connection with the background of problems as mention above, it was necessary to conduct research on Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA in the Transportation Office, South Sulawesi Provincial Government. The formulation of problem is, how the ability of RLA alumni to carry out leadership reform in his organizational unit? The purpose of this research is to improve RLA training in the future.

LITERATURE REVIEW

This study discusses some aspects of the state civil apparatus, academy leadership reform and post training evaluation. Based on the discussion of these aspects, there is a need for a study entitled Post-Training Evaluation-the Alumni of RLA in the Transportation Office, South Sulawesi Provincial Government.

State Civil Apparatus abbreviated as ASN is a profession for civil servants and government employees with work agreements where they work in government agencies (Article 1 of Law No. 5/2014). In accordance with his profession, ASN performs its duties as a public servant. To carry out public service duties as well as possible, ASN employees are managed based on ASN management with a merit system and good governance. Every ASN employee has the right and opportunity to develop competence. development of these competencies includes education and training, seminars, courses and upgrading. Furthermore, the results of competency development must be evaluated by authorized officials and used as a basis for office appointments and career development (Article 70 of Law No. 5/2014).

Referring to the regulations concerning State Civil Apparatus, this study selected respondents from the ASN. They among others: an employee who is an alumni of the competency development program through RLA training. In addition, another respondents were also selected from an ASN in various levels. They are a superior, a colleague and a subordinate of RLA alumni. Research concerning post training evaluation-the alumni of RLA in data collection stage produced input on perceptions of changes in attitudes an ASN as the alumni of RLA training.

Reform Leadership Academy is a type of training conducted for the needs of reform leaders. The aim of RLA to form a figure of apparatus who has the knowledge and competency of leadership in order to support the acceleration of the implementation of bureaucratic reform. The target of RLA to realize apparatus competent, capable to make changes in apparatus resources and implementing bureaucratic reform programs in institution.

The RLA training process includes a series of breakthrough project assignments that contain challenges with the level of certain difficulties. The success of participants in overcoming challenges in each task will making reform leader. Through the RLA, competencies are built from the State Civil Apparatus. The competencies that are built include: (1) the ability to understand conceptual concepts and bureaucratic reform policies; (2) the ability to manage change; (3) the ability to make a road map and make proposal documents for bureaucratic reform in his institution; (4) the ability to manage the performance in institution; (5) the ability to monitor and evaluate the implementation of bureaucratic reform in institution; and (6) the ability to develop action plans for bureaucratic reform in institution (Regulation the Head of LAN No. 8/2013).

Based on this policy, questionnaires and interviews were prepared based on the objectives, and competencies that were built in the RLA training process. In this way, researcher can collect data about the perception of a change in attitude from an ASN employee after attending RLA training.

Post Training Evaluation consists of 4 (four) levels, namely: (1) Reaction level: To what degree participants react favorably to the training event. So, the degree to which participant find the training vaforable, engaging and relevant to their jobs. (2) Learning level: To what degree participants acquire the intended knowledge, skills, and attitudes based on their participation in the learning event. Thus, the degree to which participants acquire the intended knowledge, skills, attitude, confidence and commitment based on their participation in the training. (3) Behavior level: To what degree participants apply what they learned during training when they are back on the job. Or the degree to which participants apply what they learned during training when they are back on the job. (4) Result level: To what degree targeted outcomes occur as a result of learning event(s) and subsequent reinforcement. The degree to which targeted outcomes occur as a result of the training and the support and accountability package (Kirkpatrick, J. and Kirkpatrick W.K., 2014).

Researcher in this connection select to focus on level 4, namely result. This result is an aspect that was assessed in the post-training evaluation. Thus it can be known about the result of the training, support organization, and accountability.

The purpose of this post-training evaluation to find out the knowledge, skills and attitudes that the participants did not have before the training after the training process can be owned properly (Yani, 2012). Regarding the purpose of post-training evaluation is the empowerment of alumni. The activity is important to do after the training phase has been completed. Post-training alumni empowerment activities include trainee efforts to carry out continuous innovation, knowledge sharing, and transfer of positive culture in the work environment. In addition, it is necessary for the organization to provide support from the continuation of the implementation of innovative trainees, the implementation of post-training competitions, and assistance and monitoring of job performance of trainees after training (Suryanto, A. 2018).

According the researcher, the post-training alumni empowerment activities and organizational support activities after the training phase is completed are important to be carried out to improve alumni's abilities.

Post training evaluations include evaluations of superiors, subordinates, colleague and customer on alumni's abilities in aspects namely: planning new changes; change leadership; and development of change. These aspects include: First, the aspect of planning new changes. The perceptions of the supervisor, subordinate, colleague and customer on alumni's abilities in this aspect were measured using

indicators, namely: (1) conformity to focus of change with national bureaucratic reform policies; (2) feasibility of change; and (3) rationalizing the plan of change.

Post training evaluations include evaluations of superiors, subordinates, colleague and customer on alumni's abilities in aspects namely: planning new changes; change leadership; and development of change. These aspects include: First, the aspect of planning new changes. The perceptions of the supervisor, subordinate, colleague and customer on alumni's abilities in this aspect were measured using indicators, namely: (1) conformity to focus of change with national bureaucratic reform policies; (2) feasibility of change; and (3) rationalizing the plan of change.

Second, aspects of leadership change. Perceptions of an superior, an subordinate, an colleague and an customer on alumni's abilities in this aspect were measured using indicators, namely: (1) ability to deal with problems; (2) problem-solving skills; (3) toughness and firmness in carrying out the project; (4) ability to cooperate; and (5) compliance with bureaucratic ethics. Third, aspects of developing change. The perceptions of the superior, subordinate, colleague and customer on alumni's abilities in this aspect are measured using indicators, namely: the ability to develop change; and the ability to build networking. (Regulation The Head of LAN No. 8/2013). Based on these indicators, researcher compiled instrument post-evaluation training. To find out the RLA results and changes in the attitudes of RLA alumni both according to their own perceptions; and according to the perceptions of superior, colleague and subordinate of RLA alumni.

Besides that, based on the search for other relevant research, it is known that there is a study that is relevant to this study. The Center of Study, Education & Training for Apparatus, National Institute of Public Administration, has carried out the research of Post-Training Evaluation for Leadership in Level II, III, and IV, in 2017. Training for leadership in level II, III and IV is a requirement for ASNs who will hold positions for echelon II, III and IV. Although RLA training is equivalent to Level II Leadership training (Regulation the Head of LAN No. 37/2015). However, the prvious study did not covering the evaluation of post-training RLA training.

In the second half of 2018, researcher conducted a study entitled Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of Reform Leadership Academy in Pontianak City Government. The results of the study showed, the ability of the RLA alumni was increase in strategy of innovation; and innovative solutions to solve work unit problems. (Wiryanto, W, 2018). Therefore, it is necessary to carry out Post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA. This research are expected useful to complementary the previous research. If previous research in city government (Pontianak Government City), then this research was conducted in the provincial government (South Sulawesi Government Province).

METHODOLOGY

This research uses a descriptive method. Through a purposive sampling technique chosen a sample. The sample of this study is alumni of RLA. This research was conducted in the third quarter of 2018. Data collection was carried out by conducting field research into the transportation office, South Sulawesi Provincial Government. The respondents of this study were an ASN in this office. As responden are four ASN from some level, among others: (1) an alumni of RLA; (2) a superior; (3) a colleague; and (4) a subordinate the alumni of RLA. The results of data collection are sourced from respondents' answers to the questionnaire; and interviews between researchers and respondents.

Furthermore, processing and presentation are presented in the form of tables that present perceptions. The tendency of perception using the Guttman scale (Sugiyono, 1998) with intervals consisting of: "yes" or "no". It can be seen in tables 1 and 2. In addition, the Likert scale is used as follows: (1) decrease; (2) static; (3) increase; and (4) Very increase. It can be seen in tables 1, 2 and 4. In addition, a Likert scale

is used as follows: (1) less significant; (2) quite significant; (3) significant; and (4) very significant. It can be seen in table below.

DATA ANALYSIS

The researcher has collected data compiled into the results of research on post-training evaluation of the Reform Leader Academy (RLA). By using data collection instruments, namely questionnaires and interviews, then obtained data from respondents. The respondents of this study consisted of 4 (four) respondents. The four respondents included: (1) RLA Alumni; (2) Superior; (3) Colleague; and (4) subordinate from the alumni of RLA. The results Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni RLA are in the form of perceptions from each respondent as outlined below.

Firstly, an alumni perceptions: Post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA can be seen from the results of data collection using instruments namely questionnaires and interviews. The questionnaire that was answered by alumni about RLA post-training evaluation after processing indicated, there was a tendency the ability of alumni's was very increase after training. This is presented in table 1.

The RLA post-training evaluation questionnaire answered by alumni showed (table 1), there was a tendency for the alumni ability to increase greatly after attending this training. This tendency includes 3 (three) aspects of assessment, namely: the ability of the alumni themselves; the relationship between RLA training material and required competencies; and organizational support for innovative solutions. The tendency as follows:

- (1) Self-ability of alumni after participating in RLA training is "very increased" in conducting problem analysis; innovative intervention solutions to solve work unit problems; map stakeholders; strategic communication; communication to subordinates and colleagues in coordinating tasks; monitor innovative solution interventions; build an effective work team; build work motivation of subordinates and colleagues; and a strategy to push for ideas, ideas for innovation in work units. An explanation of the perception of "very increased" was described in the description of table 1 column 3.
- (2) The relationship between the RLA training material and the competencies needed in carrying out the task, indicated tendency a "very significant" relationship. There are 4 (four) competencies taught during training that have a "very significant" relationship, namely: Ability to analyze problems; provide innovative solutions; stakeholders-mapping in building effective teams; and ensure the successful implementation of innovative solutions. The existence of a "very significant" relationship is explained by stating that the ability to analyze problems and provide innovative solutions is carried out in carrying out tasks assigned by the South Sulawesi provincial government, and the Directorate General of Railways, Ministry of Transportation.

Table 1. Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA based on an Alumni Perception

Statement	Perception	Explanation
1. Ability to analyze problems in the work unit	Very increase	Very concerned with the problems related to the development of railway transportation.
2. Ability to carry out innovative solutions to problem-solving	Very increase	Give a solution in the development of inter-city rail transportation.
3. Ability to mapping stakeholders to solve problems in work units	Very increase	Developing inter-city rail transportation coordinates with stakeholders through socio-cultural approach.
4. Strategic communica-	Very	Build intensive

tion capabilities for stakeholders to reach the program unit	increase	communication with stakeholders related to transportation.
5. Commitment to renewing intervention / innovation solutions	Very increase	Build personal communication with the Director General of Railways.
6. Communication ability with subordinate & colleague employee in coordinating tasks	Very increase	Every problem is always discussed through two-way communication and joint meetings.
7. Ability to build effective work	Very increase	Work is distributed proportionally according to the duties and functions of each employees.
8. Ability to build work motivation from subordinate and colleague employees	Very increase	Giving support always.
9. Communication strategies to push ideas in work units	Very increase	Make meetings and explain potential conflicts.
10. The most significant material in the implementation of tasks, namely:		The ability to analyze problems and provide innovative solutions is carried out in carrying out the tasks provided by the provincial government; and Director General of Railways about .
a. Analysis of the problem:	Very significant	construction of railway transportation modes between the cities of Mamminasata.
b. Giving innovative solution:	Very significant	
c. Stakeholders mapping to build effective team:	Very significant	
d. Confirm the result for implementing innovative solutions:	Very significant	
11. Support from work units for innovative interventions/ solutions initiated, including:		The Ministry of Transportation strongly supports the realization of trains between the cities of Mamminasata.
a. Policy:	Yes	
b. Infrastructure:	Yes	
c. Budget:	Yes	
d. Human Resources:	Yes	

Source: tabulation of data post-training evaluation the alumni-of RLA, questionnaire filled-in by an alumni, Makassar, 2018.

- (3) There was organizational support for innovative interventions/ solutions initiated by alumni. Support provided by the organization includes: Policy support, infrastructure, budget and Human Resources. It was explained that the Directorate General of Railways, the Ministry of Transportation strongly supports the procurement of Mamminasata trains so that it is continued by implementing preliminary studies of the railroad system.

Interviews between researchers and alumni about RLA post-training evaluation, are further descriptions. In the analysis phase of the problem, it was discovered that there were problems with the plan of railroad transportation between the cities of Makassar, Maros, Sungguminasa, and Takalar (Mamminasata). The plan does not work for 5 (five) years. Then, there was an idea for problem solving, which was to continue the Mamminasata railroad transportation plan. Then the idea was addressed to the directorate general of the railroad to get support for the implementation of the idea. Furthermore, support was realized with a budget to finance the preliminary study of Mamminasata railroad transportation. In addition, in the activities of the Directorate General of Railways, there are 2 (two) alternative investor countries, namely Japan and

South Korea. Furthermore, the selected country is South Korea to explore investors there in railway cooperation. In this case, the alumni concerned are scheduled to leave for South Korea to explore investors there with funding from the Ministry of Transportation in November 2018. The process of determining plans for activities in the transportation sector was carried out by competing between state civil servants from various other provincial governments. They each submitted a plan for activities in the transportation sector to the transportation ministry. In this case, the alumni of training won the competition with plans to implement railway transportation Mamminasata inter-city in South Sulawesi Province.

Secondly, a superior perception: Post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA can be seen from the results of data collection using instrument namely questionnaire and interview. The results of processing data from questionnaire by a superior from the alumni indicated there was a tendency the ability of alumni's was very increase after training. This is presented in table 2.

Answer content the questionnaire about Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA by a colleague from the alumni (table 3) shows, there is a tendency for alumni skills to very increase after attending this training. The tendency is as follows: (1) The self-ability of RLA alumni in general was "very increase" in analyzing work unit problems; innovative interventions/solutions; stakeholder mapping, strategic communication; and monitor innovative interventions / solutions. An explanation the perception of "very increase" was described in table 2 column 3. (2) There was a superior support for innovative interventions/solutions initiated. The support provided includes policies, facilities, budget and human resources. It was explained that the support of transportation development efforts was provided in the form of policies, facilities, budgets and human resources. So, there are similarities in perceptions between alumni (table 1) and a superior (table 2) there was organizational/ leadership support for innovative interventions/ solutions that initiated.

Interviews between researcher and superior regarding post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA, was description below. The results of the interview are as follows: (1) The railway procurement program is the plan of the previous governor, but has stop for five years. Furthermore, this plan was implemented again by the new governor. (2) The superior of the alumni also gives advice on organizing the RLA training. RLA training participants need to be equipped with communication skills to report to superiors after the training is complete. In particular, the alumni activity plan was followed-up, through intensive communication so that the superior of the alumni had no difficulty in providing guidance. So, RLA training participants need to communicate with the superior intensively. If the superior was not informed, then the superior did not know the planned activities that must be follow up.

Table 2. Post-Training Evaluation of the Alumni RLA based on a Superior Perception

Statement	Perception	Explanation
1. The ability of alumni to analyze work unit problems	Very increase	Very intense towards the problem of developing rail transportation in coordinating with the central government.
2. The ability to interventions/ innovative solutions for problemsolving in work units	Very increase	Provide innovative solutions to the development of railway transportation.
3. The ability to do stakeholder mapping that contributes to problem solving in work unit	Very increase	Actively build stakeholders for the development of railway transportation.

4. The ability to carry out strategic communication to stakeholders for the success of the program in work unit	Very increase	Intensive in communication and participation in transportation development.
5. The ability to monitor innovative intervention/ solution	Very increase	In the development of railway transportation, it always builds communication in all directions, both from government agencies and to stakeholders/ community transportation.
6. Support from a leader for innovative intervention/ solution initiated:		As a leader supports efforts to develop transportation through policies, facilities, budgets and human resources.
a. Policy:	Yes	
b. Infrastructure:	Yes	
c. Budget:	Yes	
d. Human Resources:	Yes	

Source: tabulation of data post-training evaluation the alumni-of RLA, questionnaire filled-in by a superior, Makassar, 2018.

Thirdly, a colleague perception: Post training evaluation the alumni of RLA can be seen from the results of data collection using questionnaire and interview instruments. Questionnaire entries by colleagues from alumni were then processed. The results of processing data from questionnaire by alumni colleague indicated the ability alumni of RLA has a positive. It was presented in table 3.

The content of questionnaire about Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA by a colleague (table 3) indicated about alumni's self-ability in general based on his observations in 2018 (table 3 column 3). Alumni are responsive to transportation problems by analyzing the problem; always actively involved in providing solutions to transportation development problems; and able to coordinate with stakeholders to solve transportation development problems; and very actively build communication with stakeholders both organizationally and personally. However, a colleague cannot give more answer, especially in table 3 column 2. A colleague does not know about the alumni's ability in RLA. Because, an alumni have joined RLA training since 2017, while he has a new position and as a colleague on April 2018.

Interviews between researchers and a colleague about RLA post-training evaluation, are further descriptions. The results of the interview indicated that alumni have a high sensitivity to problems both inside and outside their main tasks and functions. He tried to realize railroad transportation between the cities of Mamminasata intensively. Furthermore, a meeting was held to address the Mamminasata railway transportation plan at the Ministry of Transportation. As a result, the Ministry of Transportation approved the plan. Furthermore, the alumni of RLA were given the task of conducting investment cooperation in the field of railways in South Korea. All Scheduling and financing of these tasks from the Ministry of Transportation.

Table 3. Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA based on a Colleague Perception

Statement	Perception	Explanation
1. The ability of alumni to analyze problems in the work unit	-	Respond to analyzing transportation problems.
2. The ability to carry out innovative interventions/ solutions to problem solving in the work unit	-	Always actively involved in solutions to problems in transportation development.
3. The ability to map	-	Actively build

stakeholders who contribute problem solving in the work unit		communication with the Technical Unit and the Provincial, District, City Regional Organizations and the Ministry.
4. The ability to communicate strategically with stakeholders for the success in the work unit	-	In the framework of developing transportation, it is able to coordinate with stakeholders in solving problems.
5. The ability to monitor innovative interventions/ solutions	-	Very active in building communication with related elements both organizationally and personally.

Source: tabulation of data post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA, questionnaire filled-in by a colleague, Makassar, 2018.

Fourthly, a subordinate perception: Post training evaluation the alumni of RLA can be seen from the results of data collection using questionnaire and interview instrument. The result of processing data from questionnaire entries by subordinate indicated there was a tendency the ability of alumni's was very increase after training. It was presented in table 4.

Table 4. Post-Training Evaluation the Alumni of RLA based on a Subordinate Perception

Statement	Perception	Explanation
1. The ability to communicate	Very increase	Able to communicate well
2. The ability to involve complete staff work	Very increase	Always pay attention staff to complete tasks.
3. The ability to build a work team	Very increase	Build good cooperation
4. The Ability to motivate work	Very increase	Motivate directed work
5. The ability to inspire ideas	Very increase	Able to inspire ideas of change

Source: tabulation on post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA, questionnaire filled-in by a subordinate, Makassar, 2018.

In addition, in the activities of the Directorate General of Railways, there are 2 (two) alternative investor countries, namely Japan and South Korea. Furthermore, the selected country is South Korea to explore investors there in railway cooperation. In this case, the alumni concerned are scheduled to leave for South Korea to explore investors there with funding from the Ministry of Transportation in November 2018. The process of determining plans for activities in the transportation sector was carried out by competing between state civil servants from various other provincial governments. They each submitted a plan for activities in the transportation sector to the transportation ministry. In this case, the alumni of training won the competition with plans to implement railway transportation Mamminasata inter-city in South Sulawesi Province.

There was tendency the alumni of RLA. His ability is very increased after following this training, in aspects including: communication, motivation involving staff, building a work team, and inspiring appearance of ideas. An explanation the perception of "very increase" was described in table 4 column 3.

Thus, the results of this study show as follows, the ability of alumni RLA is very increase in carrying out innovation and problem-solving in their duties and responsibilities. There was a significant relationship between RLA training materials and competencies. There is organizational support for alumni in carrying out innovative solutions initiated, in the form of policies, infrastructure, budgets, and human resources. The results of this study reinforce the results of previous studies namely an ability of the RLA alumni was increase in

strategy of innovation; and innovative solutions to solve work unit problems.

CONCLUSION

Post-training evaluation were based on perceptions from various respondents including: the alumni of RLA (table 1); an superior (table 2), an subordinates from alumni (table 4) shown, there are similarities in perceptions between them, the ability of alumni of RLA training was very increased in aspects, namely: analyzing work unit problems; mapping of stakeholders; involvement completed staff work; building a work team; work motivation; strategic communication, inspires appearance of ideas; conducting innovative interventions/ solutions and monitoring. In addition, alumni colleague (table 3) have a positive perception of the work attitude the alumni of RLA training.

Finally, post-training evaluation the alumni of RLA in the Transportation Office, South Sulawesi Provincial Government indicated, the ability of alumni RLA is very increase. The capability of alumni will not be realized without the role of superior in providing facilitation support the alumni of RLA in various important aspects. Support in the form of policies, facilities, budgets and human resources provided by an superior to him give impact on improving work capabilities. It was concluded, the ability of employees could be improved through providing training to employees such as the RLA training. In addition, there was an important factor, namely the support or facilitation from an superior in some aspects among others policies, means of budgeting and human resources.

References:

- Kirkpatrick, J. and Kirkpatrick W.K., (2014). *The Krikpatrick Four Level A Fresh Look After 55 Years 1959-2014*, 3
- Peraturan Kepala Lembaga Administrasi Negara Nomor 8 Tahun (2013) *Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Diklat Kepemimpinan Reformasi Birokrasi*.
- Peraturan Kepala Lembaga Administrasi Negara Nomor 37 Tahun (2015) *Tentang Pedoman Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Reform Leader Academy*.
- Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 81 Tahun 2010 Tentang Grand Design Reformasi Birokrasi 2010-2025*.
- Pusat Kajian Pendidikan dan Pelatihan (PKP2A) Aparatur IV Lembaga Administrasi Negara (2017). *Kajian Evaluasi Pasca Diklat Kepemimpinan tingkat II, III, dan IV. Aceh Besar*.
- Sugiyono, 1998. *Metode Penelitian Administrasi*, Bandung. CV Alfabeta.
- Suryanto, A., 2018. *Strategi Peningkatan Efektifitas Pelatihan Kepemimpinan: Telaah Teoretis dan Empiris*. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*. Volume 14/No.1/83.
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 5 Tahun (2014) *tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara*.
- Wiryanto, W., (2018) *Seminar Nasional Forum Manajemen Indonesia ke-10*, Palembang. 252.
- Yani, M., (2012). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta. Mitra Wacana Media. 81-83.